

**FULL BOARD MEETING  
WEDNESDAY, MAY 16, 2007 – 6:30PM  
THE STANLEY ISAACS NEIGHBORHOOD CENTER  
415 EAST 93<sup>RD</sup> STREET  
COMMUNITY ROOM**

**Present:** Joie Anderson, Elizabeth Ashby, Michele Jane Birnbaum, Matthew A. Bondy, Deirdre Breslin, Roy H. Carlin, Barbara Chocky, Sarah Chu, James Gerard Clynes, Christina R. Davis, Jonathan Ehrlich, William Friedland, George W. Fuchs, Ruth Halberg, Benjamin Kallos, Karen Karpowich, Dave Kleckner, Edward B. Kramer, David Liston, Jacqueline Ludorf, Laura Mayer, Jane Parshall, Ellen Polivy, Rita Lee Popper, Margaret Price, Diane Rosen, David L. Rosenstein, Barbara Rudder, William Sanchez, Judith Schneider, M. Barry Schneider, Teri Slater, Cos Spagnoletti, H. Patrick Stewart, Betty Cooper Wallerstein, Elaine Walsh, Charles S. Warren, Hedi White

**Absent (Excused):** Richard Burg, Susan Grossman, Susan Lek, Laura Lijewski, Kenneth Mills, Kenneth M. Moltner, Nneka Pope, Dan Quart, Susan Shapiro, Helene Simon, Nicholas Viest

**Absent (Unexcused):** Manuel Bellod

**Arrived Late:** Matthew Bondy, Jonathan Ehrlich, William Friedland, Elaine Walsh

The meeting was called to order at 6:30 PM by David G. Liston, Chair.

Mr. Liston announced that he has received numerous complaints from several Board Members, members of the public, and elected officials and their staff, about Board Members speaking amongst themselves during Full Board, Land Use, and other Board meetings, and even moving from seat-to-seat around the room in order to chat with other Board Members over the course of meetings. He said that he has noticed this problem and has repeatedly asked those responsible to stop. He added that such conversations are distracting to others, are disrespectful to the people who have the floor, disrupt the orderly flow of meetings, and prevent people from being fully engaged in the meeting.

Mr. Liston further stated if that the subject of such conversations is Board business then such conversations between Board Members should be, consistent with the Open Meetings Law, conducted openly and with the full participation of the Board and the public. He added that if the subject of such conversations is not Board business then the conversations should wait until the conclusion of the meeting.

He concluded by stating that he will have no further tolerance for such disruptions, will stop meetings in order to request that such conversations cease, and will take such further steps as are necessary and appropriate to deal with this issue.

**2. Public Session:**

**Update on the exterior restoration work at the Guggenheim Museum, 1071 Fifth Avenue.**

- **Mr. Marc H. Steglitz, Chief Operating Officer of the Guggenheim Museum gave an update on the exterior restoration work being done at the Museum.**

## **Full Board Meeting**

**May 16, 2007**

**Page Two**

- Ms. Gladys Sanders-Valdes of the New York Public Library asked everyone to write a letter to their elected officials in support of six-day library service.
- Mr. Michael M. Luther urged Community Board 8 to oppose the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 51 East 78<sup>th</sup> Street.
- Ms. Joie Anderson spoke in opposition to advertisements placed on sidewalks.

**5. Manhattan Borough President's Report:** Ms. Amy Martinez-Miller represented the Borough President. Ms. Miller announced that the Borough Presidents' Community Training would continue on Monday May 21, 2007. Several Board Members asked that Ms. Martinez remind the Borough President of the importance of street trees to the quality of life for all Manhattan residents.

### **6. Elected Officials' Reports:**

- a) Congresswoman Carolyn Maloney – Mr. Brice Peyre represented the Congresswoman. Mr. Peyre reported that the Congress Woman continues her efforts to secure funding for the rehabilitation of the Roosevelt Island Sea Wall.
- b) NYS Senator Liz Krueger – Mr. Brad Usher represented the Senator. Mr. Usher reported that Senator Krueger presented to US Senate Colleagues the need to examine the 421-a tax incentive program.
- c) NYS Senator Jose Serrano – Mr. Brian Levinson represented the Senator. Mr. Levinson reported that the Senator continues to oppose the death penalty in New York State and continues to support affordable housing in New York State.
- d) Council Member Dan Garodnick – Council Member Garodnick reported that he was successful in having the Rent Guidelines Board change the time of its public meetings in order to allow for greater input from renters. Council Member Garodnick also announced that he has hosted an art exhibition for students earlier that afternoon and the subject of the exhibition is NYC in 2030.
- e) Council Member Jessica Lappin – Ms. Jane Swanson represented the Council Member. Ms. Swanson reported that the Council Woman has now returned from maternity leave. Ms. Swanson also reported that a middle school task force has been formed by the New York City Council. This task force will examine how to make middle schools more effective for all New York City children. Community Board 8 members reminded the Council Member the importance of street trees to the quality of life for all Manhattan residents.
- f) NYS Assembly Member Jonathan Bing – Mr. Keith Powers represented the Assembly Member. Mr. Powers reported that the New York State Assembly recently passed bill A. 1249, authored by Assemblyman Bing. This important piece of legislation would increase access to the Senior Citizen Rent Increase Exemption (SCRIE) by excluding social security payments and supplemental security income from the definition of "income" for the purposes of determining eligibility under SCRIE.
- g) Linda Jones-Janneh from the Office of the Manhattan District Attorney office provided a description of the Community Affairs Unit and announced an upcoming Tenant Forum.

**7. Chair's Report David G. Liston:** Mr. Liston thanked the Stanley Isaacs Neighborhood Center for hosting this meeting of Community Board 8. He noted that, just as Board meetings are held annually on Roosevelt Island, Board meetings should be held annually at the Stanley Isaacs

**Full Board Meeting  
May 16, 2007  
Page Three**

Neighborhood Center as a way of recognizing that the residents of the Stanley Isaacs Houses are important and valued members of the community represented by Community Board 8.

Mr. Liston mentioned that Liz McKee and Will Sanchez represented Community Board 8 at a very productive forum at the Manhattan District Attorney's Office at which various issues related to public safety and criminal justice were discussed. He thanked Ms. McKee and Mr. Sanchez for participating in the forum. He also thanked Linda Jones-Janneh, Community Coordinator for the D.A.'s Office, for hosting the forum and for being such an effective and hard working liaison between the D.A.'s Office and Community Board 8.

Mr. Liston announced that he is considering the creation of a committee dedicated to issues related to senior citizens. He asked Board Members to share with him their views as to whether such a committee ought to be created. Several Board Members expressed support for the idea. Several Board Members stated that they felt that issues related to seniors, while important, are already being covered by existing committees, and that Board Members are already stretched thin by so many Board and other commitments. Mr. Liston said he would not rush to make any decisions on this issue and that he would welcome continued input from the Community Board and from members of the public. He also asked those interested in serving on such a committee to advise him of their interest.

Mr. Liston reminded those present that there will be an informational meeting for new and veteran members on June 4, 2007. He noted that this will be an important meeting for all members at which various committees, procedures, and policies will be discussed. He said that all new Board Members are expected to attend this meeting and that veteran Board Members are encouraged to attend. He added that Committee Chairs are required to attend, as they will be expected to introduce new Board Members to the work of their committees.

Mr. Liston observed that several new Board Members have expressed an interest in serving on one committee or another. He said that he would make formal assignments following the June informational meeting. In the meantime, he asked new members to attend as many meetings of as many committees as possible so that they can get a sense as to where their interests and talents are most at home. He also asked new Board Members to consider membership on committees that have fewer members than other committees.

Mr. Liston announced that he has made a number of decisions regarding several Committee Co-Chairs. He said that he was particularly excited about his appointment of several newer Board Members to Committee Co-Chair positions. As examples, he noted that Roy Carlin will now serve with Barbara Chocky as Co-Chair of the Budget Committee; David Kleckner will now serve with Jackie Ludorf as Co-Chair of the Environment & Sanitation Committee; David Kleckner will now serve with Ken Mills as Co-Chair of the Communications Committee; and Sarah Chu and George Fuchs will serve as Co-Chairs of the newly-formed Julia Richmond Education Complex/Hunter College Committee. He noted that the Housing Committee still needs a Co-Chair to serve with Nneka Pope and he urged people interested in appointment to that position to speak with Ms. Pope and with him.

Mr. Liston congratulated Elaine Walsh for being recognized what by the City Controller as a Distinguished Irish American.

**Full Board Meeting  
May 16, 2007  
Page Four**

Mr. Liston reported that Nneka Pope and Helene Simon are recovering and have expressed appreciation for the best wishes of Board Members.

**8. District Manager's Report Elizabeth McKee:** Ms. McKee thanked members of the Stanley Isaacs Neighborhood Center for providing space for the Community Board 8 meeting. Ms. McKee also announced that at the April 27, 2007 Borough Service Cabinet meeting the Department of Environmental Protection presented regulations regarding construction noise. Ms. McKee reported that this presentation is available in both electronic form and hard copy in the Board 8 office. Also discussed at the April 27, 2007 BSC meeting was the issue of increased Saturday work permits issued by Department of Buildings. Many community boards have requested that the specific reason for Saturday work be listed on the permit displayed at the site.

Ms. McKee than reported that she attended an Informational Forum at the Manhattan's District Attorney's Office. This forum provided insight into the working of the Community Affairs Unit at the DA's office. Ms. McKee also announced that Summer Fire Safety Brochures are available in all board member packets.

**9. Committee Reports & Action Items:**

**Landmarks Committee: Reported by William Friedland – Co-Chair of the Landmarks Committee:**

**1. 22 East 66<sup>th</sup> Street, Upper East Side Historic District –** A Modern style eighteen story building designed by Rosario Candela. The application is for an amended renovation of an existing eating and drinking establishment on the first floor.

**WHEREAS,** 22 East 66<sup>th</sup> Street is a four story townhouse building; and

**WHEREAS,** Community Board 8 approved this application at its September 2006 meeting; and

**WHEREAS,** the applicant proceeded with the work before Landmarks Preservation Commission approval; and

**WHEREAS,** Community Board 8 condemns work done without Landmarks Preservation Commission approval,

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED,** Community Board 8 takes no position on this application  
*Community Board 8M passed this resolution by a vote of 29 in favor, 8 opposed and 0 abstentions.*

**2. 24 East 81<sup>st</sup> Street, Metropolitan Museum Historic District**

**WHEREAS,** 24 East 81<sup>st</sup> is a six story townhouse constructed in 1900-1902; and

**WHEREAS,** the application is to add a rooftop addition and a rear yard addition; and

**WHEREAS,** the proposed rooftop addition would be 10' in height set back 16' from the façade; and

**WHEREAS,** the proposed rooftop addition would be clad in a greenish glass with brick on the side; and

**WHEREAS,** the proposed changes are barely visible from the public way,

**(A) THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED,** the application for the form of the rooftop addition is approved

*Letter (A) of this resolution was passed by a vote of 37 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions.*

**(B) THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED,** the application for the materials of the rooftop addition be disapproved

*Letter (B) of this resolution was passed by a vote of 37 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions.*

**Full Board Meeting  
May 16, 2007  
Page Five**

**(C) THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED**, the application for the rear yard addition be approved

*Letter (C) of this resolution was passed by a vote of 37 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions.*

**3. 1133 Fifth Avenue, Carnegie Hill Historic District - A** neo-Federal style apartment building designed by Emery Roth. The application is for a window opening on the South façade of the building.

**WHEREAS**, 1133 Fifth Avenue is a neo-Federal style apartment building designed by Emery Roth; and

**WHEREAS**, the application is to add a window to the South façade on the 9<sup>th</sup> floor; and

**WHEREAS**, the proposed window is 6 over 1 in style and painted to match the existing windows; and

**WHEREAS**, the proposal would not disturb any of the existing quoins,

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED** the application be approved,

**THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED**, Community Board 8 commends the building for its fenestration plan,

**THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED**, Community Board 8 recommends any new windows be vertically aligned with the current proposal.

*Community Board 8M passed this resolution by a vote of 38 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions.*

**4. 870 Fifth Avenue, Upper East Side Historic District – A** twenty-one story Modern style apartment building designed by William I. Hohaus. The application is to add two new fixed windows to the existing façade.

**WHEREAS**, 870 Fifth Avenue is a 21 story Modern style building designed by William Hohaus; and

**WHEREAS**, the proposal is to add one window each on the 20<sup>th</sup> floor and the 21<sup>st</sup> floor facing West; and

**WHEREAS**, the proposed windows are 4' X 7' 6"; and

**WHEREAS**, the proposed windows are single pane with aluminum frames to match the existing windows; and

**WHEREAS**, the proposal is jarring and is not harmonious with the existing design of the building,

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED**, the application is **disapproved**.

*Community Board 8M passed this resolution by a vote of 34 in favor, 4 opposed and 0 abstentions.*

**5. 1185 Park Avenue, Carnegie Hill Historic District – A** neo-Gothic style apartment building designed by Schwartz & Gross. The application is to alter the side entrance.

**WHEREAS**, 1185 Park Avenue is a neo-Gothic style apartment building designed by Schwartz & Gross; and

**WHEREAS**, the application is to replace a door on 93<sup>rd</sup> Street with a window to match the others on the ground floor; and

**WHEREAS**, the proposed window would conform to the building masterplan;

**WHEREAS**, the proposed changes are in character with the building;

**WHEREAS**, the proposal enhances the beauty of the 93<sup>rd</sup> Street façade,

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED**, the application be approved

*Community Board 8M passed this resolution by a vote of 38 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions.*

**6. 51 East 78<sup>th</sup> Street, Upper East Side Historic District – A** five-story brick tenement designed by Thom & Wilson. The application is for a window replacement and the installation of a stairway bulkhead at Apartment 5A - 5D.

**Full Board Meeting  
May 16, 2007  
Page Six**

**WHEREAS**, 51 East 78<sup>th</sup> Street is a 5 story brick apartment building designed by Thom and Wilson; and

**WHEREAS**, the application is for a rooftop addition and reconfiguration; and

**WHEREAS**, the proposed addition would be 8' X 15' in size with an oak faced façade;

**WHEREAS**, the proposed addition would be set back 26' from the façade;

**WHEREAS**, the proposal would place a condenser unit on the roof, replacing several through the wall units; and

**WHEREAS**, the proposed changes will be barely visible from the street,

**(A) THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED**, the application for the shape and form be approved  
*Letter (A) of this resolution was passed by a vote of 38 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions.*

**(B) THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED**, the application for the materials be disapproved  
*Letter (B) of this resolution was passed by a vote of 38 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions.*

*With no further business the meeting was adjourned at 9:45 pm.*